

- Final Action
 City Council
 Planning Commission



Planning Commission Meeting Agenda Report

Subject: Costco Wholesale - Development Plan 2018-1652, Conditional Use Permit 2018-1653 and Tentative Parcel Map 37511

Date: August 26, 2020

Prepared by: Dennis Watts, Senior Planner

Reviewed by: Jarrett Ramaiya, City Planner

Approved by: Ivan Holler, Assistant City Manager

RECOMMENDATION

1. Adopt a Resolution Certifying the Final Environmental Impact Report ("FEIR") and Adopt the Statement of Overriding Considerations, and the Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program; and
2. Adopt a Resolution approving Development Plan 2018-1652, Conditional Use Permit 2018-1653, and Tentative Parcel Map 2018-1654 (TPM 37511) based on the findings and subject to the conditions of approval in Exhibit A, B, C, and the Mitigation Monitoring Reporting Program (MMRP) in Exhibit D.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Application Type(s): Development Plan 2018-1652
Conditional Use Permit 2018-1653
Tentative Parcel Map 2018-1654 (TPM 37511)

Applicant: Costco Wholesale (Jenifer Murillo)

Property Owner(s): Costco Wholesale, Candee Family LLC, CK 17 LP, Scott 215 LP, and Lambda Investments LLC

Site Area: 26.05 acres

Project Location: East of Antelope Road, northerly of Clinton Keith Road and westerly of Bronco Way
Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 392-290-025, -026, -028, -029, -051, 392-270-030 and -033



Site General Plan/Zoning: GP Designation: Commercial (C)/ Zone Designation: Regional Commercial (RC)

Adjacent Zoning/Land Use:

North: Regional Commercial (RC)/Vacant Land
South: Regional Commercial (RC) / Commercial Center under construction
 Regional Commercial and Multi-Family-2 / Vacant and Existing residences
East: Regional Commercial (RC) / Vacant
West: Regional Commercial (RC) / Vacant

The proposed project consists of a Development Plan, a Conditional Use Permit, and a Tentative Parcel Map. Tentative Parcel Map 37511 proposes a total of eight parcels and two letter lots and is broken up into two units. Unit 1 is located on the west side of proposed Warm Springs Parkway and consists of two parcels. Unit 2 is located on the east side and consists of six parcels. The lettered lots represent dedications for public roads, Warm Springs Parkway and Antelope Road.

	<u>Unit 1</u>	<u>Unit 2</u>
	Parcel 1 - 15.21 acres	Parcel 3 - 0.633 acres
	Parcel 2 - 1.21 acres	Parcel 4 - 0.713 acres
	Lot B - 0.03 acres	Parcel 5 - 1.298 acres
		Parcel 6 - 3.618 acres
		Parcel 7 - 0.846 acres
		Parcel 8 - 0.731 acres
		<u>Lot A - 1.745 acres</u>
Total	<u>16.45 acres</u>	<u>9.584 acres</u>

Development Plan 2018-1652 proposes to develop 16.42 acres on the western side of Warm Springs Parkway (Unit 1 of TPM 37511) as a 153,362 square foot warehouse retail store with a 32 pump fueling facility, and a 12,678 square foot canopy over the fueling facility. The project proposes three vehicle access locations. Two proposed entrances are to be located off of the newly constructed Warm Springs Parkway, with the southerly access controlled by a traffic signal, and a third access off of Antelope Road. The project involves the construction of Warm Springs Parkway along the project's eastern frontage. The finished floor level is proposed at 1,538 feet above sea level. The site is designed to provide for 799 parking spaces, with 24 of the spaces as being reserved for electric vehicle charging stations, which will be installed as part of the development. Pedestrian access to the site will be provided from Warm Springs Parkway through an enhanced pedestrian pathway, and the project will also provide for 40 bicycle parking spaces and six long-term bicycle storage lockers.

Conditional Use Permit (CUP-2018-1654) is required for the proposed tire installation operations proposed as part of the retail store, which offers tire sales to their customers. The tire installation operation is located on the southeast portion of the building consisting of approximately 2,700 square feet of area (see Attachment 3B) and does not include other automotive repair such as oil changes, tune-ups, brakes, etc. The CUP also includes the request for an outside display area for the display of



promotional vehicle sales located near the front of the building. The area is devoted to the display of up to two automobiles as part of the services offered by the business. Attachment 3A indicates the proposed display locations as part of the CUP.

BACKGROUND

A majority of the site has experienced extensive disturbance from a mass grade permit issued in 2006. The mass grade permit was issued to the property owner, Candee Family, LLC under a separate permit unrelated to the current applications being considered. Grading operations under that prior mass grade permit concluded in 2019. Aerial photography, as provided by Google Earth, indicate that most of the project site's' ground surface has been disturbed by the excavation activities.

ANALYSIS

Zoning / General Plan Consistency:

The proposed development of a warehouse retail building and fueling facility would provide for various retail and personal services, which is consistent with the "Commercial" General Plan Land Use designation. The proposed Project development and retail sales use is consistent with and implements many of the city's General Plan policies and objectives. For example, the proposed Project is consistent with General Plan Goal LU-1 - "to provide a complementary balance of land uses throughout the community that meets the needs of existing residents and businesses as well as anticipated growth, and achieves the community's vision", with General Plan Policy LU-1.2- "To ensure future development provides for a variety of commercial, industry, and housing that serve the spectrum of incomes within the region". The Project implements land use goal LU-6 as it encourages job attraction and accompanying policy LU-6.10 by securing a retail use that complements and serves the existing uses in the North Murrieta Business Corridor Focus Area. The Project is consistent with General Plan Goal LU-7, which strives for economically viable, vital, and attractive commercial centers throughout the City that serve the needs of the community by implementing Policy LU-7.1 and LU-7.5 and 7.6. Those policies focus on having development near major transportation corridors with convenient freeway access through ultimate development of an economically viable project for the community.

The Project is also consistent with General Plan Goal LU-9 and Policy LU-9.6 and LU-9.7 which call for land use patterns and urban design to support healthy and sustainable lifestyles and business. The center contains design elements such as enhanced paving and pedestrian elements that provide connections between the building and the public sidewalk. The Project is consistent with Circulation Element Goal CIR-1 and implements policy CIR-1.8 providing additional turn lanes on Warm Springs Parkway and Clinton Keith Road which enhances the vehicular capacity. The Project is consistent with Goal INF-1 and meets Policy INF-1.4, as the Project is conditioned to construct the necessary infrastructure for sewer, water, electricity, storm water, and street improvements.

The Project implements Policy CSV-9.3 and CSV-12.6 by providing a landscape buffer between the sidewalk and street and will install water efficient landscaping, solar panels, and electric vehicle charging stations. The Project implements General Plan Policy ED-2.2- "Improve the ongoing fiscal revenue and



cost structure of the City, particularly revenue growth potential associated with retail, and restaurant land use development, business activities”.

Zoning-The proposal is consistent with the allowed uses and development standards for the Regional Commercial (RC) zone. The development meets the RC zone for building setbacks, height limits, and applicable development standards identified in Section 16.10 of the Development Code for commercial development, including internal circulation, architectural design, and parking standards.

Site Design: The proposed site design, building setbacks, on-site landscaping, and building height are in compliance with the Regional Commercial zone designation. The buildings, as proposed, have parapet walls at an elevation to screen roof-mounted equipment from the public streets adjacent to the project site.

Traffic Circulation / Access & Egress:

As described in the project description portion of the staff report, three access driveways are proposed for the Project, two from Warm Springs Parkway, and one from Antelope Road. A Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) was prepared for the proposed Project and anticipated that the Project would generate approximately 8,378 new daily trips with a weekday PM peak of approximately 353 trips inbound and 386 trips outbound. The TIA identified that for the existing conditions, all study intersections currently operate at a satisfactory Level of Service (LOS), except for three (3) intersections, Salida Del Sol and Clinton Keith Road, Elizabeth Lane and Clinton Keith Road, and Max Gillis Boulevard/Thompson Road and SR-79. Adding in the anticipated traffic from the proposed Project (Existing plus Project), one additional intersection would be impacted where the LOS would fall below the acceptable level of service (California Oaks Road and Clinton Keith Road). Adding in the proposed Project and surrounding anticipated projects' trips (Cumulative), five other intersections (Mitchell Road/Murrieta Oaks Road and Clinton Keith Road, Creighton Avenue and Clinton Keith Road, Bronco Way and Clinton Keith Road, Whitewood Road and Clinton Keith Road, and Max Gillis Blvd/Briggs Rd. and Leon Rd.) would be impacted to levels below the acceptable LOS.

The TIA determined that as part of the project implementation the following improvements are required: Warm Springs Parkway is required to be dedicated and constructed along the project frontage in addition to a new traffic signal at the southerly most access drive. The Project is also required to stripe an additional eastbound lane on Clinton Keith Road from Nutmeg Street to California Oaks Road and extend turning pockets at the following intersections:

- Greer Rd/Murrieta Oaks Ave & Clinton Keith Rd. (SBLT)
- Mitchell Rd./Murrieta Oaks Ave & Clinton Keith Rd. (WBL)
- High School West Driveway/Warm Springs Parkway & Clinton Keith Rd. (EBL)
- Whitewood Road & Clinton Keith Road (NBL & SBL)

Additionally, the Project is also required to pay fair share contributions to several other intersections that require turning pockets to be extended or re-striping to add an additional lane. Another fair share contribution will be made toward an Adaptive Signal Timing system which will ultimately assist in the synchronization of signals to improve traffic flow along the Clinton Keith Road corridor. The value of the



fair share contributions is based on the percentage of traffic the Project contributes toward the intersection. The site plan shows the proposed improvements and conceptual lane configuration along the project frontage. A future access is contemplated from Clinton Keith Road and Creighton Avenue; however, it will require agreements from the adjacent property owner and city approval, prior to the access being constructed. Even with the recommended improvements, there are still some intersections that do not operate at acceptable levels of service, which is discussed in further detail in the environmental section of the staff report.

As of July 2020, new California Environmental Quality Act regulations require cities to evaluate traffic using a newly adopted criteria called Vehicle Miles Travelled (VMT). The city recently adopted an updated general plan (July 21, 2020) which incorporates the requirements of the new state law. This project was already deemed complete and had issued a Notice of Preparation prior to the enactment of the law and General Plan update; and therefore is not subject to the VMT requirements.

Architecture / Aesthetics:

The proposed architecture of the building and fuel canopy is complimentary with the development in the surrounding area. The architectural theme/design meets the Commercial District design requirements identified in Development Code Section 16.10.030.C in terms of design consistency, form and mass, and roof design. The building and fueling canopy is constructed with a combination of two colors of split face block, a smooth face block, and combination of ribbed and textured metal panels. Steel accents are located at the main entrance and near the entrance of the tire center entrance to provide accent and façade variation (See Concept Elevations). Additionally, the building incorporates building relief by providing plane and material changes in the façade. Lastly, all the roof-mounted equipment will be screened from public views.

Parking:

The City's Development Code requires 767 parking spaces based on a ratio of 1 parking space for every 200 square feet of building floor area. The required rates and square footages are identified on the site plan. The Project proposes 799 parking spaces with 24 spaces equipped with electric charging stations, and another 24 spaces capable for future installation of electric charging. All parking spaces are required to be constructed in compliance with the requirements identified in the Development Code Section 16.34.040. The Development Code requires 40 bicycle parking spaces and 6 long-term (storage lockers) bicycle spaces for employees. As proposed, the Project complies with the city's parking requirements.

Landscaping:

The Project is providing approximately 15 percent landscaping of the site, which is below the minimum 20 percent requirement for the RC zone. A 15-foot wide landscape area is proposed along all Warm Springs Parkway, the southern and westerly property lines. A minimum 5-foot landscape area is provided along the northern property line with some larger landscape pockets occurring at various areas. The Project site is located within a Very High Fire Hazard Severity Zone (VHFHSZ) and is limited to a specific fire resistive plant palette and is also limited to the spacing of trees/shrubs on the property, which limits the project's ability to provide the minimum percentage of beneficial landscape area. In an effort to make up for some of that landscape area, the Project proposes green screens adjacent to the building façade along the east and west elevations which consist of a metal mesh attached to the building wall and the



planting of vines to grow through the metal meshed area. A pedestrian walkway from the public sidewalk to the building frontage is proposed. This walkway includes enhanced paving, trellis cover, seating area, combined with landscape elements all of which will create a better pedestrian experience. Section 16.02.010 of the Murrieta Development Code allows development standards to be modified if it is determined that the standard is inappropriate for the proposed development and that it will not affect public health and safety. In this case, staff has determined that due to the VHFHSZ restrictions, requiring the additional landscape area would not be beneficial. The Project also added in green screens and a pedestrian walking/seating element to offset the deficiency. The proposed landscaping materials and placement comply with the City's requirement for plantings that have a reduced demand for water and the tree placement spacing is spread evenly throughout the project site.

Conditional Use Permit(s):

Tire Installation Operation: A tire installation operation is proposed as part of the project, which requires a Conditional Use Permit (automotive repair). The hours of operation are generally from Mon-Fri. 10:00am - 8:30pm, Sat. 9:30am - 6:00pm, and Sun. 10:00am - 6:00pm. The primary topics of focus for the tire installation are for locational criteria, aesthetics, and noise. The tire installation operation is proposed in conjunction with the sales of tires from the warehouse store and is located at the south facing part of the building. The building is setback approximately 440 feet from Warm Springs Parkway and over 1,100 feet from the residences located to the east. Ample landscaping is located within the parking lot and along the project frontage which will minimize views of the tire installation operations. General automotive repair is not proposed by the applicant and any tire installation/repair work is prohibited outdoors.

Outdoor Display-Promotional: The proposed outdoor display for an automobile is associated with the business' automobile sales program. No vehicle sales occur at the site. The vehicles would be located near the front entry of the store (See Attachment 3B) and has been conditioned to meet specific standards such as placement in a specific location. The requested Conditional Use Permit, as conditioned, meets the requirements of the Development Code.

Drainage, Water and Sewer:

The Project is conditioned to implement the necessary construction of drainage, water, and sewer improvements to serve the project in compliance with the requirements of the Eastern Municipal Water District (EMWD) and City of Murrieta. The Project is required to comply with the requirements of EMWD with regards to water and sewer connections, water efficient appliances, and landscaping. The Project has prepared a Preliminary Water Quality Management Plan (WQMP) to address the treatment methods of the Project's water run-off to ensure compliance with the State and City's water quality treatment requirements. The WQMP proposes a series of bio-retention basins located within many of the planters of the parking lot, in combination with subsurface treatment systems (under parking lot), as the major components of water quality treatment.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION



The Project was evaluated pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and it was determined that an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the Project be prepared. The Draft EIR determined that there would be impacts related with air quality and traffic which could not be reduced to a level of less than significant, even with the imposition of feasible mitigation measures. Section 2.2. of the Findings of Fact (Attachment 5) identifies the specific impacts that are significant and unavoidable. Accordingly, the Planning Commission would have to make a “Statement of Overriding Consideration” (Attachment 5 – Facts, Findings and Statement of Overriding Considerations) that concludes that the benefits of the project outweigh the unavoidable significant environmental impacts and deems those unavoidable significant impacts “acceptable.” Otherwise, all other project impacts associated with Aesthetics, Agriculture and Forestry Resources, Air Quality, Biological Resources, Cultural Resources, Geology and Soils, Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Hazards and Hazardous Materials, Hydrology/ Water Quality, Land Use and Planning, Mineral, Noise, Population and Housing, Public Services, Recreation, Tribal Cultural Resources, Utilities and Service Systems, Wildfire, and Energy Conservation were found to be either less than significant or less than significant with the adoption of mitigation measures (Attachment 5, Section 4 – Mitigation Monitoring Reporting Program).

The 45-day public review period for the Draft EIR started on May 20, 2020 and ended on July 6, 2020. The City received twelve comments during the public review period: 1) Karen Fritschi, 2) Airport Land Use Commission, 3) Sandra Donato, 4) Beth Grant, 5) Annamaria Hagstrom, 6) James Kelley, 7) Rincon Band of Luiseno Indians, 8) Daniel Basubas, 9) Gloria Bernal, 10) Riverside County Flood Control & Water Conservation District, 11) South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD), 12) Bruce Tepper. Based on the City’s review of the comments on the Draft EIR, minor modifications to the Draft EIR and mitigation measures were made to address comments in the comment letters. The specific Chapters/Sections of the Draft EIR modified were Chapter 1-Project Summary, Chapter 4.2-Air Quality, Section 4.6-Greenhouse Gas Emissions, and Section 4.16-Energy (See Attachment 5-Final EIR). None of the corrections or additions constitutes significant new information or substantial project changes requiring recirculation of the EIR, as defined by Section 15088.5 of the CEQA Guidelines.

It is recommended that the Planning Commission certify that the Final EIR has been (1) prepared in compliance with CEQA; (2) the EIR was presented to the Planning Commission and the Planning Commission reviewed and considered the information in the EIR prior to approving the Project, including a determination that the EIR contains mitigation measures that mitigate a majority of the environmental impacts to a level of less than significant; (3) for items not mitigated and therefore would potentially cause significant impacts, a Statement of Overriding Considerations has been prepared determining the project benefits outweigh the potential impacts, and (4) the EIR reflects the City of Murrieta’s independent judgment and analysis.

NOTICING

The Project was noticed in compliance with Section 16.76 of the Development Code. The City posted a sign on the property, mailed notices to property owners within a 500-foot radius, advertised in the newspaper a minimum of 10 days prior to the hearing.

ATTACHMENTS

Resolution –Environmental Impact Report



Resolution – Development Plan/Tentative Parcel Map/Conditional Use Permit

Exhibit A – Draft Conditions of Approval for Development Plan 2018-1652

Exhibit B – Draft Conditions of Approval for Conditional Use Permit 2018-1653

Exhibit C – Draft Conditions of Approval for Tentative Parcel Map 37511

Exhibit D – Mitigation Monitoring Reporting Program

1. Vicinity Map(s)
2. Project Plans (Reduced Version) - Full size available upon request
3. Conditional Use Permit 2018-1653 – Site Plan for Outdoor vehicle display & tire installation operation

4. Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR)
5. Final EIR (FEIR)
 - a. Comment letter and Responses
 - b. Changes to DEIR
 - c. Changes to MMRP
 - d. Facts, Findings, and Statement of Overriding Considerations
6. General Public Comments/Correspondence